

# A First Investigation of Abhayākaragupta's *Madhyamakamañjarī*

Hong Luo<sup>(1)</sup>

## Abbreviations and Sigla

### • Primary Sources in Sanskrit

AA

Maitreyaṅātha's *Abhisamayālaṅkāra*

– STCHERBATSKY & OBERMILLER 1970

HB

Dharmakīrti's *Hetubindu*

– STEINKELLNER 2016

MMK

Nāgārjuna's *Mūlamadhyamakakārikāḥ*

– DE JONG 1977; YE 2011

MSA

Asaṅga's *Mahāyānasūtrālaṅkāra*

– LÈVI 1907

PV

Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇavārttika*

– PV I: GNOLI 1960

– PV II-IV: MIYASAKA 1971/1972

---

<sup>(1)</sup> This is a revised version of my paper presented during a panel at the 2012 Beijing Seminar on Tibetan Studies, August 1 to 5. My deep appreciation goes to colleagues for their valuable comments on the earlier drafts and I thank the China Tibetology Research Center (中国藏学研究中心) for supporting my studies over many years. The last phase of my research on this topic was financed by Sichuan University in the context of the project 2018hhs-61 and Sichuan University Research Cluster for Regional History and Frontier Studies in the context of the project xkqzd2018-06.

PVin

Dharmakīrti's *Pramānaviniścaya*

– PVin I-II: STEINKELLNER 2007

Śālsū

The *Āryaśālistambasūtra*

– VAIDYA 1961: 100-106

SSŚ

Jñānaśrīmitra's *Sākārasiddhiśāstra*

– THAKUR 1987: 367-513

SSS

Jñānaśrīmitra's *Sākārasaṃgrahasūtra*

– THAKUR 1987: 515-578

TS

Śāntarakṣita's *Tattvasaṃgraha*

– KRISHNAMACHARYA 1984

Viṃś

Vasubandhu's *Viṃśikākārikāḥ*

– LÉVI 1925

YṢ

Nāgārjuna's *Yuktiṣaṣṭikā*

– LINDTNER 1982: 100-119

– LI & YE 2014

### Miscellaneous Signs

cf.	confer
D	sDe dge edition of the Tibetan Tripiṭaka
ed.	the (preferred) published edition of the text quoted
fn(s).	footnote(s)
k(k).	<i>kārikā</i> (s)
nt.	note
om.	omitted in
P	Peking edition of the Tibetan Tripiṭaka

## Editorial Signs

{ }	contain <i>akṣara</i> (s) or <i>daṇḍa</i> deleted by means of stroke(s)
*	<i>virāma</i>
,	<i>avagraha</i>
	<i>daṇḍa</i> / <i>śad</i>
	double <i>daṇḍa</i> / <i>ñis śad</i>
⊙	string-hole

As a first investigation of the *codex unicus* of Abhayākaragupta's *Madhyamakamañjarī* (henceforth, MM), the present article is aimed at providing the following:<sup>(2)</sup>

1. a brief review of the study on Abhayākaragupta and his writings,
2. a report of the quotations so far identified in the MM.<sup>(3)</sup>

Provisionally, it may fill a gap of our knowledge concerning the development of *mādhyamika* doctrine in the last period of Indian Buddhism. The imperfections and errors would hopefully be remedied and corrected in the forthcoming reports to be issue gradually in the form of critical edition and tentative English translation of the text.<sup>(4)</sup>

For tracing Abhayākaragupta's life and career, there are three kinds of sources,<sup>(5)</sup> his own works extant in Sanskrit and/or in Tibetan;<sup>(6)</sup> the colophons of the Tibetan translation of his works; and the hagiographic accounts by Tibetan scholars.

As for Abhayākaragupta's writings, Bühnemann (1992: 123–125) provided a list of the title and bibliographical information of 25 works attributed to him.<sup>(7)</sup> Without listing the

(2) For a description of the physical and paleographical features of the manuscript, see Luo 2018: 16–17.

(3) For a critical edition and annotated English translation of the opening and concluding verses of the MM, see Luo 2018.

(4) Last year, the Center for Tibetan Studies of Sichuan University hosted two events on the editing and interpreting of the MM: the First International Workshop on Abhayākaragupta's *Madhyamakamañjarī* (April 29, 2019), an International Workshop on Late *Mādhyamika* Texts (August 1–14, 2019). A further report aiming to provide an analytic synopsis of the MM is under preparation: "Untying the bouquet: A synopsis of Abhyākaragupta's *Madhyamakamañjarī*."

(5) Lee 2003: 21.

(6) Except for the MM, which for reason unknown is left untranslated, and the *Varṣāpaṇavidhi*, a short ritual text which seems to be absent in Tibetan sources, all the rest of Abhayākaragupta's writings are available in Tanjur, see below.

(7) As has been pointed out by Mori (2009: 4, fn.16), the *Vajramahākālakrodhanātharahasyasiddhibhavantra* (*dPal rdo rje nag po chen po khros pa'i mgon po gsang ba dngos grub 'byung ba zhes bya ba'i rgyud* (D. No. 0416, P. No. 0062) is not a writing by Abhayākaragupta, who was perhaps the supervisor or co-translator of the text. The wrong attribution may be due to the misinterpretation of the colophon: *dpal mgon po chen po khros<sup>1</sup> pa'i mgon po gsang ba mngon par 'byung ba'i rgyud kun gyi rtsa bar gyur pa bstan pa 'dzin pa | bstan pa skyong ba | bstan pa bsrung nges pa | gsang ba bdud dpung 'dul bar byed pa'o || dpal mgon po chen po dngos grub 'byung ba'i rgyud kun gyi snying*

titles, Skorupski (1994: 236) counted 24 works. Kapstein (2001: 414 note 1) gave 22. Lee 2003( : 45–46) enumerated 27. Tomabechi & Kano (2008: 22–23) counted 26, they further listed those the Sanskrit editions of which had been issued: the *Niṣpannayogāvalī*, the *Vaj-rāvalī*, the *Jyotirmañjarī*, the *Ucchuṣmajambhalasādhana*, and the *Svādhiṣṭhānakramopa-deśa*; and those the Sanskrit manuscripts of which were known to be extant: the *Pañcakramatātparyapañjikā Kramakaumudī*, the *Kālacakrāvātāra*,<sup>(8)</sup> the *Abhayapaddhati*, the *Āmnāyamañjarī*, the *Munimatālamkāra* and the *Madhyamakamañjarī*. The different opinions concerning the authenticity of these works were summarized by Mori (2009: 4),<sup>(9)</sup> who accepted 24 and classified them into six categories.<sup>(10)</sup> In the following, we shall present a brief description of 28 works of Abhayākaragupta:<sup>(11)</sup>

Tantric works:

### 1 *Abhayapaddhati*+

This is a comprehensive commentary on the *Buddhakapālatantra*, four Sanskrit manuscripts are extant. According to the colophon of the Sanskrit manuscript preserved in the Royal Asiatic Society of Bengal, Calcutta, it was written in the 25th year of Rāmapāla's reign at Vikramaśīla monastery. A cooperative project of editing and translating the Sanskrit text of the *Abhayapaddhati* between the Center for Tantric Studies at Hamburg University and the China Tibetology Research Center is about to be accomplished. The edition is based upon four Sanskrit manuscripts and to be published in three volumes in the Sanskrit Texts from the Tibetan Autonomous Region series: Chapters 1-5: YANG forthcoming (STTAR 12), Chapters 6-8: ISAACSON & LI forthcoming (STTAR 13), Chapters 9-14: LUO HONG 2010 (STTAR 14). CHOG DORJE (2009) published an edition of the *Abhayapaddhati* based upon two incomplete Sanskrit manuscripts<sup>(12)</sup> and the Tibetan translation.

### 2 *Āmnāyamañjarī*+

---

*por gyur pa gdod nas grub pa'i bla ma yin no rdzogs so || rgya gar gyi mkhan po ma hā pañdi ta a bha yā ka ra gup ta<sup>2</sup> pā da'i zhal snga nas dang | bod kyi lo ts'ha ba mkhas pa chen po khe'u rgad 'khor lo grags kyis bsgyur cing zhus pa'o || yang slad nas mkhas pa chen po sangs rgyas grags pa'i sphyan sngar kre bo<sup>3</sup> shes rab dpal gyis kyang zhu tig bgyis pa'o || [D292r4][P126r8]* 1. khros D: 'khrus P 2. a bha yā ka ra gup ta D: a bhya ā ka ra gup ta P kre bo D: ke bo P

(8) The only extant Sanskrit manuscript is kept in the Asiatic Society of Bengal, cf. CASB, pp. 161–162.

(9) He referred to Bühnemann & Tachikawa 1991, Isoda 1984, and Bhattacharyya 1949.

(10) Mori 2009: 5–6. Lee 2003( : 49-50) adapts another way to categorize Abhayākaragupta's works.

(11) The writings which are available in Sanskrit are marked with +, those with published, or partially published edition(s) are in boldface, those the authorship of which is uncertain are marked by an asterisk.

(12) CHOG DORJE 2009: xvii.

A complete manuscript of this work is preserved in Tibet.<sup>(13)</sup> A small fragment was edited and translated by TOMABECHI & KANO (2008). Recently, a bilingual (Sanskrit and Tibetan) manuscript of the *Āmnāyamañjarī* was found, a facsimile edition of the first half of the manuscript has been published.<sup>(14)</sup>

### 3 *Vajrāvalī*+

MORI 2009.

### 4 *Jyotirmañjarī*+

OKUYAMA 1983, OKUYAMA 1986, the edition is based upon one incomplete Sanskrit manuscript preserved in the Cambridge Library; there is another Sanskrit manuscript kept in the National Archives, Kathmandu<sup>(15)</sup> Based upon OKUYAMA 1983, 1986 and the Peking edition of the Tibetan translation, SKORUPSKI (1994) translated in its entirety the text into English.

### 5 *Niṣpannayogāvalī*+

BHATTACHARYYA 1949, LEE 2004.

### 6 *Kālacakrāvātāra*+(16)

### 7 *Kālacakroddāna*

### 8 *Cakrasaṃvarābhisamaya*

### 9 *Svādhiṣṭhānakramopadeśa*+

OKUYAMA 1993.

### 10 *Pañcakramatātparyapañjikā Kramakaumudī*+

It is also called the *Candraprabhā*, Tomabeche Toru has edited this text, based upon one Sanskrit manuscript preserved in Tibet.

### 11 *Abhiṣekaprakaraṇa*

### 12 *Bodhipaddhati*

### 13 *Gaṇacakravīdhi*

### 14 *Jñānadākinīsādhana*

### 15 *Mahākālakarmasambhāra*

### 16 *Mahākālastotra*

### 17 *Nāthakākyonitarpaṇavidhikrama*

### 18 *Raktayamāntakaniṣpannayoga*

(13) LUO ZHAO 1985b: 199-200.

(14) BWY 2015.

(15) BÜHNEMANN 1992: 124.

(16) NEWMAN 1987: 93, fn. 57. An edition has been published in the *Dhī* LIV, 1-14.

- 19 *Śrīdevīkālīstotra*  
 20 ***Ucchuṣmajambhalasādhana+***  
 BHATTACHARYYA 1925.  
 21 *Upadeśamañjarī*  
 22 *Vajramahākālābhicārahoma*  
 23 *Vajrayānāpattimañjarī*  
 24 *Varṣāpaṇavidhi+*

Based upon two manuscripts kept in Tokyo composite, Péter-Dániel Szántó has edited this text.

Works on non-tantric mahāyāna Buddhism

- 1 *Bodhisattvasaṃvaragrahaṇavidhi*  
 2 *Madhyamakamañjarī+*  
 3 *Marmakaumudī*  
 4 *Munimatālaṃkāra+*

The Tibetan translation was studied by Isoda (1984, 1987, 1991, 1998). The Sanskrit manuscript of the *Munimatālaṃkāra* has been reported and studied in Li 2013a, 2013b, Kano & Li 2013, 2014, Li & Kano 2015.

Colophons are also important materials for studying Abhayākaragupta. A collated text, based upon the sDe dge and Peking Tanjur versions, of the colophons in the Tibetan translation of all writings by Abhayākaragupta as well as the Tibetan translation of the opening and concluding verses of those writings the Sanskrit original of which is so far unknown is a desideratum.

The hagiographic narratives regarding Abhayākaragupta's life and works, in chronological order, are the following:<sup>(17)</sup>

1. Ratnarakṣita's (12th century) *Slob dpon a bha yā ka ra gupta'i lo rgyus bzhugs so*.<sup>(18)</sup>
2. Bu ston's (1290-1364) *Chos 'byung*
3. gZhon nu dpal's (1392-1481) *Deb ther sngon po*

<sup>(17)</sup> Some of the items are listed in Bühnemann (1992: 120) and Yonezawa (2001: 7).

<sup>(18)</sup> A biography of Abhayākaragupta by his disciple Ratnarakṣita. It is registered as No. 017176 in 'BRAS SPUNGS CATALOG (p. 1523). The manuscript consists of 5 folios.

4. dPa' bo gtsug lag phreng ba's (1504-1566) *lHo brag chos 'byung mkhas pa'i dga' ston*
5. Padma dkar po's (1527-1592) *Chos 'byung bstan pa'i pad ma rgyas pa'i nyin byed*
6. Tāranātha's (1575–1634) *bKa' babs bdun ldan gyi rnam thar* (written in 1600)
7. Tāranātha's (b. 1575) *rGya gar chos 'byung* (written in 1608)
8. Pan chen Blo bzang chos kyi rgyal mtshan's *Slob dpon Abhayākara'i rtogs pa brjod pa tshangs pa'i dbyangs snyan zhes bya ba bzhugs so* (completed in A.D. 1641), published in BIRESHWAR 1968: 189-192.<sup>(19)</sup>
9. Sum pa mkhan po Ye shes dpal 'byor's (1704-1788) *dPag bsam ljon bzang* (written in 1748)

Abhayākaragupta, a contemporary of king Rāmapāla, was born in north-eastern India<sup>(20)</sup> in a Kṣatriya or Brāhmaṇa family<sup>(21)</sup> and flourished from the late eleventh to the early twelfth century.<sup>(22)</sup> His root guru, according to Tāranātha, is Ratnākaragupta.<sup>(23)</sup> He succeeded Prajñākaramati<sup>(24)</sup> as the abbot of Vikramaśīla monastery.<sup>(25)</sup> SEYFORTH RUEGG (1981: 103) defined Abhayākaragupta as 'a leading later representative of' the Madhyamaka-Prajñāpāramitā synthesis, 'as well as of the Yogācāra-Svātantrika-Madhyamaka school in general and of the Madhyamaka-Vajrayāna synthesis.'<sup>(26)</sup>

In the *Abhayapaddhati*, for example, Abhayākaragupta quotes Nāgārjuna's *Bodhicitta-vivarāṇa* to clarify that the doctrine of the Vijñānavādins is soteriologically useful only on

<sup>(19)</sup> According to the colophon of Abhayākaragupta's biography by Pan chen Blo bzang chos kyi rgyal mtshan, Zhang Lo tsā ba Grub pa dpal (Phur pa skyabs, d. 1273?), a disciple of Abhayākaragupta's disciple Legs spyod 'byung gnas (Sucaritākara), wrote a biography of Abhayākaragupta, cf. BIRESHWAR 1968: 192.

<sup>(20)</sup> Three places are held to be his birth place, Jarikhaṇḍa, Gauḍa and Magadha, all of them locate in north-eastern India, cf. BÜHNEMANN 1992: 120-121.

<sup>(21)</sup> BIRESHWAR 1968: 181-182.

<sup>(22)</sup> BIRESHWAR 1968: 188, RUEGG 1981: 114, BÜHNEMANN 1992: 121-123. Following the Re'u mig appended to the *Bod rgya tshig mdzod chen mo*, NEWMAN (1987: 92, fn. 57) gives 1125 as the year when Abhayākaragupta passed away.

<sup>(23)</sup> CHATTOPADHYAYA 1970: 434. BIRESHWAR (1968: 182) states that Abhayākaragupta was initiated into Buddhist order by Ācārya Ratnākaraśānti. In Tāranātha's history, Ratnākaraśānti is reported as being later than Abhayākaragupta, cf. CHATTOPADHYAYA 1970: 313-314. This is certainly wrong. S.C. Das, however, accepted it. BIRESHWAR (1968: 182, fn. 32) pointed out this mistake, but at same time wrongly asserted that 'All Tibetan sources agree that Ratnākaraśānti ... and preceded Abhayākaragupta.'

<sup>(24)</sup> KAPSTEIN 2001: 394.

<sup>(25)</sup> Vairocanarakṣita, who lived 'some time in the 11th and 12th century', probably received instruction from Abhayākaragupta, cf. KANO 2008: 344-345, fn. 9.

<sup>(26)</sup> See also SEYFORTH RUEGG 1981: 114-115. Abhayākaragupta uses Maitreya's *Abhisamayālaṅkāra* and the *Samputatantra* as a basis for harmonizing the mahāyānic Buddhism and the tantric traditions accumulated till his time, see LEE 2003: 63-70.

the conventional level.<sup>(27)</sup> In the same work, he also asserts that the Way of Mantra (*mantranaya*) is superior to the Way of Perfections (*pāramitānaya*), but at the same time, that the Way of Perfections is absolutely essential for obtaining enlightenment.<sup>(28)</sup> The related passages find literal parallels in the *Āmnāyamañjarī* by the same author.<sup>(29)</sup>

Abhayākaragupta wrote three works on rituals, the *Niṣpannayogāvalī*, the *Vajrāvalī* and the *Jyotirmañjarī*, they are known as the ‘Garland Trilogy (*phreng ba skor gsum*)’. In the *Vajrāvalī*, Abhayākaragupta mentions no less than nine times Nāgabuddhi’s *Śrīguhyasamājamaṇḍalaviṇṣatikavidhi*, which is certainly one of the sources of his ritual compendiums.<sup>(30)</sup>

Most probably, Abhayākaragupta was intellectually indebted to Ratnākaraśānti. For example, on commenting the Bodhisattva stages, he may follow Ratnākaraśānti’s *Sāratamā*,<sup>(31)</sup> and his explanation of the verses quoted from Dīpaṅkarabhadra’s *Maṇḍalavidhi in 450 verses* echoes Ratnākaraśānti’s *Śrīguhyasamājamaṇḍalavidhiṭkā*,<sup>(32)</sup> a commentary on the same work.<sup>(33)</sup>

It is well known that Abhayākaragupta often refers to his own works. BÜHNEMANN (1992: 123-124) summarizes Abhayākaragupta’s self cross-references in his writings. This summary was later improved by LEE (2003: 47-48). What follows is a list of Abhayākaragupta’s cross references, mainly based upon LEE’s summary with new information from the *Madhyamakamañjarī* supplied:

The *Abhayapaddhati* refers to the *Āmnāyamañjarī*, *Kālacakrāvātāra* and *Vajrāvalī*.

The *Āmnāyamañjarī* refers to the *Vajrāvalī*.

The *Jyotirmañjarī* refers to the *Āmnāyamañjarī* and the *Vajrāvalī*.

The *Munimatālamkāra* refers to the *Āmnāyamañjarī*.

The *Niṣpannayogāvalī* refers to the *Cakrasaṃvarābhisamaya* and the *Vajrāvalī*.

The *Upadeśamañjarī* refers to the *Niṣpannayogāvalī*, the *Cakrasaṃvarābhisamaya* and the *Vajrāvalī*.

(27) LUO HONG 2010: 28, 91.

(28) LUO HONG 2010: 37-38, 102-104.

(29) TOMABECHI & KANO 2008: 29, 35-36.

(30) MORI 2009: 12-13, see also LEE 2003: 29, which refers to MORI 1997: 26. In his *Upadeśamañjarī*, Abhayākaragupta also mentions Nāgabuddhi several times: P. vol. 87, yu, 189v7, 191v3 and 192r6, see LEE 2003: 29.

(31) TOMABECHI & KANO 2008: 24-25.

(32) D. 1871, P. 2734.

(33) MORI 2009: 16.



The *Vajrāvalī* refers to the *Āmnāyamañjarī*, the *Cakrasaṃvarābhisamaya* (possibly), the *Jyotirmañjarī*, the *Niṣpannayogāvalī*.

In the *Madhyamakamañjarī*, Abhayākaragupta refers twice to the *Munimatālamkāra*, in the *Munimatālamkāra*, he mentions four times the *Madhyamakamañjarī*.<sup>(34)</sup>

Another important feature of Abhayākaragupta's writing is their pramāṇic style,<sup>(35)</sup> this is particularly true in the case of the *Madhyamakamañjarī*.

According to the information provided in the colophons of the Tibetan translation of Abhayākaragupta's writings, nine of them were translated in cooperation with Tibetan translators.<sup>(36)</sup> He also cooperated with Tibetan translators in translating other works, mainly *sādhana*.<sup>(37)</sup> According to 'Gos gzhon nu dpal's *Deb ther sngon po*, cooperating with sNur Dar ma grags, he translated Candrakīrti's *Śūnyatāsaptatvṛtti*<sup>(38)</sup> at Nālandā. Perhaps he also supervised the copying of a collection of Sanskrit palm-leaf manuscripts in Tibetan *dBu med* script.<sup>(39)</sup> Together with Śāntākaragupta, Śākyaraṣita and Vidyākaraśānti, he participated in the revision of the *Saddharmasmṛtyupasthāna* (*'Phags pa dam pa'i chos dran pa nye bar gzhag pa*).

The manuscript of the MM was transliterated by the present author from 2008 to 2009, following the publication of the opening and concluding verses of MM in 2018, this paper is aimed to present the so far identified quotations. They are uncritically presented in the following:

Silent quotation from Jñānaśrīmitra's *Sākārasiddhiśāstra*

tathā hi vicitrānādivāsanāvaśā᳚t prabodhakapratyayaviśeṣāpekṣayā vikalpaḥ kenacid ākāreṇopajāyamāna eva bahirmukhapravṛtyanukūlam arthakriyāsma᳚raṇābhilāpādiprabandham ādhatte | tataḥ puruṣasyārthakriyārthino bahirarthānurūpāṇi pravṛttinivṛtyavadhīraṇāṇi bhavanti | pṛthagjanasantānājñānakṣaṇānām\*

(34) TOMABECHI & KANO 2008: 22, fn. 5. One of them was identified by KAPSTEIN (2001: 413).

(35) KAPSTEIN 2001: 394.

(36) MORI 2009: 6. The *Abhiṣekaprakaraṇa*, Shes rab dpal; the *Āmnāyamañjarī*, Sangs rgyas grags pa (rTsa mi / Tsa mi of Mi nyag, see NEWMAN 1987: 84, fn. 39); the *Kālacakrāvātāra*, Dharmakīrti; the *Marmakaumudī*, Shes rab dpal; the *Munimatālamkāra*, dPang zho gSal ba grags; the *Ucchuṣmajambhalasādhana*, Tshul khriims rgyal mtshan; the *Vajramahākālābhicārahoma*, Sin dha ba/Sang rgyas grags pa; the *Vajrāvalī*, 'Khor lo grags; the *Vajrayānāpattimañjarī*, Sangs rgyas grags pa.

(37) MORI 2009: 6.

(38) SEYFORTH RUEGG 1981: 115, fn.371.

(39) YONEZAWA: 2001: 8.

tādṛśo hetuphalabhāvasya niyatatvāt\* | [5v3-4]

aniścītārthasambandhavikalpakāle pi sadasatānirṇayādipravṛttiprasavaḥ | tatra yad ubhayathāpravṛttisādhanasāmarthyam asya svahetubalāyātam ayam eva pravṛttiviśayavastvāropo dhyavasāyādyaparanāmā | yathā candrādijñānasya bhrāntasyābhrāntasya vā taddarśanāvasāyajanānam eva grahaṇavyāpārah svavid apīyam arthavid eva kāryato draṣṭavyeti nyāyāt\* | tathā śabdādiyojanānimittakasya vikalpasyāpy agnir atretyādīnākāreṇotpadyamānasya pravṛttyākṣepakatvam eva bāhyādhyavasānan nāma | yathā ca nirvikalpasya candrādyākārataiva tathāvasāyasādhanī | evam avasāyasyāpi tādṛśākārataiva viśayāntaravimukhapravṛttisādhanī | [5v6-6r1]

tad ayam atra paramārthaḥ, vividhānādivāsanāvaśāt prabodhakapratyayaviśeṣāpekṣayā vikalpaḥ kenacid ākāreṇopajāyamāna eva bahirmukhapravṛtitanukūlam arthakriyāsmaraṇābhilāpādiprabandham ādhatte | tathaḥ puruṣasyārthakriyārthino bahirarthānurūpāṇi pravṛtiniṅvṛtyavadhīraṇāni bhavanti | pṛthagjanasantānajñānakṣaṇānām tādṛśo hetuḥ bhāvasya niyatatvāt | aniścītārthasambandhavikalpakāle 'pi sadasattādirṇayādipravṛttiprasavaḥ | tatra yad ubhayathāpravṛtte sādhanasāmarthyam asya svahetubalāyātam ayam eva pravṛttiviśayavastvāropo 'dhyavasāyāparanāmā, yathā candrādijñānasya bhrāntasyābhrāntasya vā taddarśanāvasāyajanānam eva grahaṇavyāpārah | svacid apīyam arthavid eva kāryato draṣṭavyeti nyāyāt, tathā vikalpasyāpy agnir atretyādīnākāreṇotpadyamānasya pravṛttyākṣepakatvam eva bāhyādhyavasānam | yathā ca nirvikalpasya candrādyākārataiva tathāvasāyasādhanī, evam avasāyasya api tādṛśākārataiva viśayāntaravimukhapravṛttisādhanī | (SSŚ II, Thakur 1987: 393.10–21)

Asaṅga's *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra*

... tathā ca sūtrālaṅkāre | na cāntaraṃ kiñcana vidyate nayoḥ sadarthavṛttyā śama◉janmanor iha | tathāpi janmakṣayato vidhīyate śamasya lābhaḥ śubhakarmakāriṇām iti | [7r4]

na cāntaraṃ kiñcana vidyate 'nayoḥ sadarthavṛttyā śamajanmanor iha | tathāpi janmakṣayato vidhīyate śamasya lābhaḥ śubhakarmakāriṇām || (MSA: VI.5, Lèvi 1907: 23)

Nāgārjuna's *Yuktiṣaṣṭikā*

yuktiṣaṣṭyāñ ca | nirvāṇaṃ ca bhavaś caiva dvayam etan na vi◉dyate | bhavasyaiva pariñā-

nam\* nirvāṇam iti kathyata iti | [7r5]

nirvāṇam ca bhavaś caiva dvayam etan na vidyate | pariñānam bhavasyaiva nirvāṇam iti kathyate || (YS: 6, Lindtner 1982: 104; Li & Ye 2014: 14-15)

Jñānaśrīmitra's *Sākārasaṃgrahasūtra*

tathā ca sākārasiddhau advaitaśikharārohe na pravṛttinivṛttayaḥ | tā eva saṃsāra iti taddhetuḥ katham iṣyatām ity uktam | [7r7]

advaitaśikharārohe na pravṛttinivṛttayaḥ | tā eva saṃsāra iti taddhetuḥ katham iṣyatām || (SSS: II.7 Thakur 1987: 529)

Maitreyañātha's *Abhisamayālaṅkāra*

abhisamayālaṅkāre pi paramārthato niḥsvabhāvatvenaivoktam | svapnopamatvād dharmāṇām | bhavaśāntyor akalpanetyādikam | [7v1-2]

svapnopamatvād dharmāṇām bhavaśāntyor akalpanā | (AA: IV.60ab, Stcherbatsky & Obermiller 1970: 26)

Silent quotation from Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇavārttika*

etad evoktam\* | yathā phalasya hetūnām śadṛśātmatayodbhavāt\* | heturūpagraho loke 'kriyāvastve pi kathyata iti | [10v5-6]

yathā phalasya hetūnām sadṛśātmatayodbhavād | heturūpagraho loke 'kriyāvattve 'pi kathyate || (PV II.309, Miyasaka 1971/1972: 82)

dadhānaṃ tac ca tām ātmany arthādhighamanātmaneti nyāyāt\* | [12v4]

dadhānaṃ tac ca tām ātmany arthādhighamanātmanā || (PV II.307cd, Miyasaka 1971/1972: 82)

This verse is also attested in Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇaviniścaya* (PVI. I.36cd, Steinkellner 2007: 32)

ata eva sahopalambhanyamād abhedo nīlapīṭayor evoktam ācāryeṇa na tu nīlapīṭayoḥ sam-

vittiniyamo nāsti bhinnayor nīlapītayor ity ukteḥ | [22v5-6]

saṃvittiniyamo nāsti bhinnayor nīlapītayor || (PV II.389cd, Miyasaka 1971/1972: 92)

tathā cōktam\* | dharmmadharmivavasthānam\* bhedo bhedaś ca yādṛśaḥ | asamīkṣitat-  
tvārtho yathā loke pratīyate taṃ tathaiva samāśritya sādhyasādhanasamsthi ... baddhadb-  
hir avakalpyate tasmi ... parikalpyedaṃ pranāśasya lakṣaṇam iti | [27r6-7]

dharmadharmivavasthānam bhedo 'bhedaś ca yādṛśaḥ | asamīkṣitatattvārtho yathā loke  
pratīyate ||

taṃ tathaiva samāśritya sādhyasādhanasamsthiḥ | paramārthāvatārāya vidvadbhir  
avakalpyate || (PV III.85-86, Miyasaka 1971/1972: 128)

Śāntarakṣita's *Tattvasaṃgraha*

uktañ cācāryaśāntarakṣitena | vijñānapariṇāmo yaṃ kṣititejojalādikaḥ | ⊙ ātmā tadātmakaś  
ceti saṅgirante pare punar iti | [26r3]

nityajñānavivartto 'yaṃ kṣititejojalādikaḥ | ātmā tadātmakaś ceti saṅgirante 'pare punaḥ ||  
(TS: 328, Krishnamacharya 1984: 123)

Vasubandhu's *Viṃśikā* etc.

sammatatvāc ca vasubandhuprabhṛtīnāṃ | na ca svataṃtrahetau parāccheādānurodhaḥ |  
prasaṅgabādhanatve ca viparyayaparyavasānāt sādhyavirodhaḥ | na ca viṃśikādaḥ na tad  
ekaṃ na cānekaṃ viṣayaḥ paramāṇuśa ityādi bāhyeṣu prasaṅgabādhanatvaṃ ... [31r2]

na tad ekaṃ na cānekaṃ viṣayaḥ paramāṇuśaḥ | (Viṃś 11ab, Lévi 1925: 1)

Nāgārjuna's *Mūlamadhyamakārikāḥ*

ata evoktaṃ mūlamadhyamake | na saṃbhavaḥ svabhāvasya yuktaḥ pratyayahetubhiḥ |  
hetupratyayasambhūtaḥ svabhāvaḥ kṛtako bhavet | svabhāvaḥ kṛtako nāma bhaviṣyati punaḥ  
kathaṃ | akṛtrimaḥ sva ... [43r7-43v1]

na saṃbhavaḥ svabhāvasya yuktaḥ pratyayahetubhiḥ | hetupratyayasambhūtaḥ svabhāvaḥ  
kṛtako bhavet ||

svabhāvaḥ kṛtako nāma bhaviṣyati punaḥ kathaṃ | akṛtrimaḥ svabhāvo hi nirapekṣaḥ paratra

ca || (MMK XV.1-2, de Jong 1977: 19; Ye 2011: 236)

āryanāgārjunapādaiś coktaṃ | na svato nāpi parato na dvābhyāṃ nāpy ahetutaḥ | utpannā  
jātu vidyante bhāvāḥ kvacana kecaneti | [39v3]

na svato nāpi parato na dvābhyāṃ nāpy ahetutaḥ | utpannā jātu vidyante bhāvāḥ kva cana  
ke cana || (MMK I.1, de Jong 1977: 1; Ye 2011: 12)

The *Āryaśālistambasūtra*

tathā ◉ coktam āryaśālistambasūtre | so yam aṅkuro na svayaṃkṛto na parakṛto nobhayakṛto  
nāhetusamutpa◉nna iti | [39v3]

Two parallels are found in Vaidya's edition of the *Āryaśālistambasūtra*:

atha punaḥ satsu eteṣu pratyayeṣu bīje nirudhyamāne aṅkuryābhinirvṛttir bhavati | evaṃ  
yāvāt puṣpe sati phalasyābhinirvṛttir bhavati | sa ca aṅkuro na svayaṃkṛto na parakṛto  
nobhayakṛto neśvarakṛto na kālapariṇāmito na prakṛtisambhūto [na caikakāraṇādhiṅ] nāpy  
ahetusamutpannaḥ | (Śālsū, Vaidya 1961: 102.1–4)

sa ca nāmarūpāṅkuro na svayaṃkṛto na parakṛto nobhayakṛto neśvarakṛto na kālapariṇāmito  
na prakṛtisambhūto na caikakāraṇādhiṅ nāpy ahetusamutpannaḥ | (Śālsū, Vaidya 1961:  
104.33–105.1)

Abhayākaragupta's *Munimatālaṅkāra*

tathā cācalādiḥbhūbhujeniravadhidhātutrayīm prati parimāṇu paśyantīti pravaca◉nam udb-  
heditam asmābhir munimatālaṅkāre ity alam atra nirbandhena | [31r5]

sarvvadharmāṇāṃ ca niḥsvabhāvatvam eva tatvam anyat sāmṃvṛtaṃ rūpaṃ tadapekṣayaiva  
ca kalpitaparataṃtrapariniṣpannavyavasthādvikaṃ bhagavatā sphuṭaṃ prakāśitam iti pra-  
vacanenaiva vipaṅcitam asmābhir munimatālaṅkāre iti nātra pratanyate | [45r1-2]

## Bibliography

Benoytosh BHATTACHARYA

1925

*Sādhanamālā* Vol. I. (Gaekwad's Oriental Series 26). Baroda: Oriental Institute.

1928

*Sādhanamālā* Vol. II. (Gaekwad's Oriental Series 41). Baroda: Oriental Institute.

1949

*Niṣpannayogāvalī of Abhayākaragupta* (GOS 109) Baroda: Oriental Institute.

Prasad Singh BIRESHWAR

1968

A Tibetan Account of Abhayākaragupta in *Journal of the Bihar and Orissa Research Society* vol. 54, 179-198.

Gudrun BÜHNEMANN &amp; TACHIKAWA Musashi (立川 武藏)

1991

*Niṣpannayogāvalī, Two Sanskrit Manuscripts from Nepal*. (Bibliotheca Codicum Asiaticorum 5) Tokyo: The Center for East Asian Cultural Studies.

Gudrun BÜHNEMANN

1992

Some Remarks on the Date of Abhayākaragupta and the Chronology of His Works in *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft* vol. 142, no. 1, 120-127.

1993

Some Remarks on the Text of the *Niṣpannayogāvalī* as Found in Jagaddarpaṇa's *Kriyāsamuccaya*. *Zentral Asiatische Studien* 23, 18-21.

BWY

Institute of the Collection and Preservation of Ancient Tibetan Texts of Sichuan Province: *Rare and Ancient Tibetan Texts Collected in Tibetan Regions Series, Collection Edition* (volume 1). Chengdu-Beijing: Sichuan Nationalities Publishing House, Guangming Daily Press.

'BRAS SPUNGS CATALOG

dPal brtsegs bod yig dpe rnying zhib 'jug khang: *'Bras spungs dgon du bzhugs su gsol ba'i dpe rnying dkar chag* (two volumes). Beijing: Mi rigs dpe skrun khang.

CASB

*A Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Government Collection under the Care of The Asiatic Society of Bengal* by M. Hara Prasad Shastri. vol. 1: *Buddhist Manuscripts*. Calcutta 1917.

CHOG DORJE

2009

*Abhayapaddhati of Abhayākaragupta Commentary on the Buddhakapālamahāntātra*. (Bibliotheca Indo-Tibetica Series 68) Sarnath.

Jan Willem DE JONG

1977

*Nāgārjuna: Mūlamadhyamakakārikāḥ*. Madras: Adyar Library and Research Centre.

Raniero GNOLI

1960

*The Pramāṇavārttikam of Dharmakīrti. The First Chapter with the Autocommentary*. Roma: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente (Serie Orientale Roma 23).

ISODA Hirofumi (磯田 熙文)

1984

Abhayākaragupta: *Munimatālaṃkāra* (Text) (I). In: *The Annual Reports of the Faculty of Arts and Letters Tohoku University* vol. xxxiv (*Tōhoku Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyū Nenpō* / 東北大学文学部研究年報), 251-320.

1987

Abhayākaragupta: *Munimatālaṃkāra* (Text) (II). In: *The Annual Reports of the Faculty of Arts and Letters Tohoku University* vol. xxxvii (*Tōhoku Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyū Nenpō* / 東北大学文学部研究年報), 138-176.

1991

Abhayākaragupta: *Munimatālaṃkāra* (Text) (III). In: *The Annual Reports of the Faculty of Arts and Letters Tohoku University* vol. xxxxi (*Tōhoku Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyū Nenpō* / 東北大学文学部研究年報), 1-42.

1998

Abhayākaragupta: *Munimatālaṃkāra* (Text) Chapter II. In: *The Annual Reports of the Faculty of Arts and Letters Tohoku University* vol. xxxviii (*Tōhoku Daigaku Bungakubu Kenkyū Nenpō* / 東北大学文学部研究年報), 1-32.

KANO Kazuo (加納 和雄)

2008

Two Short Glosses on Yogācāra Texts by Vairocanarakṣita: *Viṃśikāṭīkāvivṛti* and *\*Dharmadharmatāvibhāgavivṛti*. In *Sanskrit Texts from Giuseppe Tucci's Collection Part I*. Ed. Francesco Sferra. Roma: Istituto Italiano Per L'Africa E L'Oriente, 343-380.

Matthew T KAPSTEIN

2001

Abhayākaragupta on the Two Truths. In: *Reason's Traces. Identity and Interpretation in Indian & Tibetan Buddhist Thought* (Studies in Indian and Tibetan

Buddhism) Boston: Wisdom Publications, 393-415.

Embar KRISHNAMACHARYA

1984

*Tattvasaṅgraha of Śāntarākṣita with the Commentary of Kamalashīla*. (GOS No. XXXI) (3 Vols.) Baroda.

LEE Yong-hyun (李 龍賢)

2003

*Synthesizing a Liturgical Heritage: Abhayākaragupta's Vajrāvalī and the Kālacakraṃḍala*. Unpublished dissertation submitted at the University of Wisconsin-Madison.

2004

*The Niṣpannayogāvalī by Abhayākaragupta. A New Critical Edition of the Sanskrit Text (Revised Edition)*. Seoul: Baegun Press.

Sylvain LÈVI

1907

*Mahāyāna-Sūtrālaṅkāra*. Paris.

1925

*Vijñaptimātratāsiddhi, deux traits de Vasubandhu. Viṃśatikā (la vingtaine) accompagnée d'une explication en prose et Triṃśikā (la trentaine) avec le commentaire de Sthiramati, original sanscrit publié pour la première fois d'après des manuscrits rapportés du Népal. Ire Partie: Texte*. Paris: Librairie ancienne Honoré Champion.

Chris LINDTNER

1982

*Nagarjuniana. Studies in the writings and philosophy of Nāgārjuna*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers Private Limited (reprinted in 1990).

Li Xuezhu (李 学竹)

2013a

Diplomatic Transcription of the Sanskrit Manuscript of the *Munimatālaṃkāra* Chapter 1: Fols. 1v1–3v5. *China Tibetology* 20, 1–11.

2013b

「Munimatālaṃkāra の梵文写本」、『密教文化』229 25–35

Li Xuezhu (李 学竹) & Kano Kanuo (加納 和雄)

2015

Critical Edition of the Sanskrit text of the *Munimatālaṅkāra* chapter 1 (fol. 48r4–



58r5): Explanation of *skandha*, *dhātu*, and *āyatana* based on Candrakīrti's *Pañcaskandhaka*, *Journal of Esoteric Buddhism*, 234, 83–120.

Li Xuezhu (李学竹) & Ye Shaoyong (叶少勇)

2014

《〈六十如理颂〉梵藏汉合校导读译注》，梵藏汉佛典丛书2，上海，中西书局。

Luo Hong (罗鸿)

2010

*Abhayākaragupta's Abhayapaddhati Chapters 9 to 14*. STTAR (Sanskrit Texts from the Tibetan Autonomous Region) vol. 14. Beijing-Hamburg: China Tibetology Publishing House.

2018

The opening and concluding verses of Abhayākaragupta's *Madhyamakamañjarī*, *China Tibetology*, vol. 31, 15-23.

MIYASAKA Yūsho (宮坂宥勝)

1971/1972

*Pramāṇavārttika-Kārikā. (Sanskrit and Tibetan). (AI 2) 1971/72.*

MORI Masahide (森雅秀)

1997

*The Vajrāvalī of Abhayākaragupta. A Critical Study, Sanskrit Edition of Selected Chapters and Complete Tibetan Version*. Thesis presented for the Doctor of Philosophy at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.

2009

*Vajrāvalī of Abhayākaragupta. Edition of Sanskrit and Tibetan Versions (Buddhica Britannica Series Continua xi)* Tring: The institute of Buddhist studies.

John Ronald NEWMAN

1987

The Outer Wheel of Time: Vajrayāna Buddhist Cosmology in the Kālacakra Tantra. (Unpublished dissertation at the University of Wisconsin - Madison).

OKUYAMA Naoji (奥山直司)

1983

*Jyotirmañjarī no kenkyū (I)*. In: *Bundka* (Sendai) 47/1-2, 29-46.

1986

*Jyotirmañjarī no kenkyū (II)*. In: *Tōhoku Indogaku Shūkyō Gakkai Ronshū* (Sendai) 13, 108-91.

1993

Indokōkimikyō niokeru jikoshinkakukaron: Abhayākaragupta cho Jishinkajishidai no upadeśa (On the Self-apotheosizing in Indian Tantric Buddhism: Abhayākaragupta's *Svādhiṣṭhānakramopadeśa*). In: *Indogaku Mikkyōgaku Kenkyū: Miyasaka Yūshō hakase kokikinen ronshū*, vol. 1, Kyoto: Hōzōkan, 809-826.

G.N ROERICH

1996

*The Blue Annals* Calcutta: 1949; repr. Delhi: Motila Banarsidass Publishers Private Limited.

David SEYFORTH RUEGG

1981

*The Literature of the Madhyamaka School of Philosophy in India*. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.

Tadeusz SKORUPSKI

1994

*Jyotirmañjarī*: Abhayākaragupta's Commentary on Homa Rites. In: Bulletin of the Research Institute of Esoteric Buddhist Culture. (Mikkyō Bunka Kenkyūsho Kiyō / 高野山大学密教文化研究所紀要) vol. 8, 236-206.

T STCHERBATSKY &amp; E OBERMILLER

1970

*Abhisamayālaṅkāra-Prajñāpāramitā-Upadeśa-Śāstra*. (Bibliotheca Buddhica XXIII) Osnabrück: Biblio Verlag.

Ernst STEINKELLNER

2007

*Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇaviniścaya. Chapters 1 and 2*. (STTAR II) Beijing – Vienna.

2016

*Dharmakīrti's Hetubinduḥ*. (STTAR 19) Beijing – Vienna.

Anantalal THAKUR

1987

*Jñānaśrīmitranibandhāvali: Buddhist Philosophical Works of Jñānaśrīmitra*. Patna.

TOMABECHI Toru (苦米地 等流) &amp; KANO Kazuo (加納 和雄)

2008

A Critical Edition and Translation of a Text Fragment from Abhayākaragupta's *Āmnāyamañjarī*: Göttingen, Cod.ms.sanscr.259b". In *Tantric Studies* Volume 1, Center for Tantric Studies, Hamburg, 22-44.

P. L. VAIDYA

1961

*Mahāyānasūtrasamgraha Part I.* (Buddhist Sanskrit Text 17). Darbhanga: Mithila Institute.

YE Shaoyong (叶少勇)

2011

《<中论颂>梵藏汉合校导读译注》梵藏汉佛典丛书1, 上海: 中西书局

YONEZAWA Yoshiyasu (米澤嘉康)

2001

*The INTRODUCTION to the Facsimile Edition of a Collection of Sanskrit Palm-leaf Manuscripts in Tibetan dBu-med script* The Institute for Comprehensive Studies of Buddhism, Taishō University.

**key words** Abhayākaragupta, Madhyamakamañjarī